

BALDPATE-1

ALTERNATIVE ROUTE COMPARISON TO PROPOSED ROUTE

Table Appendix B-25 Evaluation and Comparison of the Proposed Route to the Baldpate-1 Alternative Route (MP 104.9R2 – MP 108.4R2)		
Proposed Route	Alternative Route	Evaluation/Comparison
General Information		
Length: 3.51 miles	Length: 4.46 miles	The Alternative Route is nearly one mile longer than the Proposed Route. The Alternative Route has a greater construction cost by a factor of 1.6.
Collocated Length: 3.51 miles (u)	Collocated Length: 4.46 miles (r)	
Construction Cost: \$41,328,685	Construction Cost: \$64,750,940	
Construction Duration: 4 months	Construction Duration: 3.5 months	
Regulated Resource Impact: Wetlands		
Wetland Areas Crossed: 10	Wetland Areas Crossed: 3	The Proposed Route has a greater impact on wetlands.
Crossing Method: 7 open-cut 2 trenchless (HDD) 1 trenchless (bore)	Crossing Method: 3 open-cut	
Impact: PFO Impact = 1.84 acres PEM Impact = 2.78 acres PSS Impact = 0.05 acres MODAG Impact = 0.14 acres	Impact: PEM Estimated Impact: 0.03 acres PSS Estimated Impact: 0.08 acres MODAG Estimated Impact: 0.23 acres	
Regulated Resource Impact: Wetlands		
Waterbodies Crossed: 12	Waterbodies Crossed: 4	With the implementation of trenchless technology construction (HDDs and bores) along the Proposed Route, there is no observed difference in anticipated impacts.
Classification: 2 Moores Creek UNTs (FW2-TM) 1 Moores Creek (FW2-TM) 1 Fiddlers Creek (FW2-TM) 8 Fiddlers Creek UNTs (FW2-TM)	Classification: 3 Moores Creek UNTs (FW2-TM) 1 Moores Creek (FW2-TM)	
Crossing Method: 4 (FW2-TM) dry crossings 2 (FW2-TM) trenchless (HDD) 4 (FW2-TM) trenchless (bore) 2 (FW2-TM) access road (culverted)	Crossing Method: 4 (FW2-TM) dry crossings	
Regulated Resource Impact: T&E Species		
Habitat Mapping: Fowler’s Toad Golden-Winged Warbler (non-breeding) Kentucky Warbler (breeding) Northern Copperhead (occupied) Veery (breeding) Wood Turtle (occupied) Worm-eating Warbler (breeding)	Habitat Mapping: Brown Thrasher (breeding) Eastern Meadowlark Golden-Winged Warbler (non-breeding) Kentucky Warbler (breeding) Northern Copperhead (occupied) Veery (breeding) Worm-eating Warbler (breeding) Yellow-breasted Chat	No observed difference in anticipated impacts.
Regulated Resource Impact: Cultural Resources ^{1,2}		
Architectural Properties: 1 One historic district.	Architectural Properties: 1 One historic district.	No observed difference in anticipated impacts.
Archaeological Sites: None	Archaeological Sites: None	
Logistics: Traffic Impact		
None	Construction of the pipeline within Valley Road, Pleasant Valley Road, and Bear Tavern Road will require the	Implementation of the Alternative Route roadway closures and detours would significantly increase project related traffic

Table Appendix B-25
Evaluation and Comparison of the Proposed Route to the Baldpate-1 Alternative Route
(MP 104.9R2 – MP 108.4R2)

Proposed Route	Alternative Route	Evaluation/Comparison
	closure of each roadway. During road closures, detours will be required as detailed in Traffic Analysis provided in Appendix C.	impacts during construction. The closure and detours would have adverse impacts as detailed in the Traffic Analysis provided in Appendix C.
Logistics: Proximity to Structures and Residences³		
None	There are 6 residences and four barn/garage structures in close proximity to the workspace of the pipeline.	The Alternative Route has greater potential impacts to structures and residences.
Logistics: Emergency Services Impact		
None	The Alternative Route construction would require partial roadway closures and some total roadway closures during pipeline construction. During this time, emergency services would be required to use detour routes.	Full or partial road closures associated with construction of the Alternative Route would adversely impact response times for emergency services on a localized basis.
Logistics: Impact to Places of Public Assembly		
An access road and project workspace intersect the Baldpate Pleasant Valley Parking Lot.	This Alternative Route is proximate to Howell Living History farms, Gravity Hill/Roots to River Farm, Baldpate Mountain, and Royal Crest Farms.	No observed difference in anticipated impacts.
Logistics: Constructability		
None	The construction of the Alternative Route would require the temporary or permanent relocation of many utility poles and associated utility lines along the roadways. Roadside guiderails, creek crossing stone abutments, and stone walls would have to be removed and reinstalled. There may be times where residents are not able to access their properties.	The Alternative Route has greater constructability issues.
Conclusion		
<p>After taking into consideration its greater cost, greater potential impact to structures and residences and logistical limitations including anticipated community impacts and constructability, the Baldpate-1 Alternative Route is dismissed as impracticable.</p> <p>PennEast strives to minimize locating the pipeline in areas prone to any amount of an increased operational risk as much as practicable. Implementing the alternative routes within the roadway would substantially increase the linear footage of the project within areas at an elevated operational risk for third-party damage. The probability of third-party excavator accidents, a major cause of natural gas transmission pipeline incidents over the past 20 years, is higher with pipelines located within roadways due to the higher frequency of excavation activities that increase the probability of accidental striking of the pipeline, such as the installation and maintenance of other subsurface infrastructure (e.g. water lines, fiber optic cables, sewers, etc.), building construction activities, and roadway resurfacing.</p>		
Legend: N/A – Not Applicable r – road		rr – railroad u – utility UNT – Unnamed Tributary
Notes:		

Table Appendix B-25
Evaluation and Comparison of the Proposed Route to the Baldpate-1 Alternative Route
(MP 104.9R2 – MP 108.4R2)

Proposed Route	Alternative Route	Evaluation/Comparison
<p>1 Unless otherwise noted, includes only those resources listed on or determined eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). Sources: "Historic Districts of New Jersey" and "Historic Properties of New Jersey" datasets, 28 January 2019, available at http://njogis-newjersey.opendata.arcgis.com/datasets?q=historic; and/or recorded by AECOM on behalf of PennEast Pipeline Company, LLC, as of June 2019.</p> <p>2 Includes NRHP-eligible and/or listed archaeological sites as well as those that have not been evaluated for NRHP eligibility. Source: archaeological site locations on file at the New Jersey State Museum as of 12 March 2019; and/or recorded by AECOM on behalf of PennEast Pipeline Company, LLC, as of June 2019.</p> <p>3. Close Proximity - In terms of structures and residences is defined as within 50 feet of the workspace</p>		